

**FOOD SAFETY AND STANDARDS AUTHORITY OF INDIA
FDA BHAWAN, KOTLA ROAD,
NEW DELHI- 110002.**

**Minutes of the Tenth Meeting of Food Authority held on 20th September, 2012
at 1100 hrs at FDA Bhavan, New Delhi**

The tenth meeting of the Food Safety and Standards Authority of India (FSSAI) was held on 20/09/2012 at 11.00 AM at FDA Bhawan, Kotla Road, New Delhi under the Chairmanship of Shri K. Chandramouli, Chairperson, Food Safety and Standards Authority of India. The Members present in the meeting are as per Annexure-I. Leave of absence was granted to the members who could not attend.

Chairperson welcomed all the members present in the meeting. He emphasized that the Food Authority is now in a different mode. During the first eight meetings, we discussed about the Act and drafting of rules, regulations, procedures after consultations with stakeholders. After 5th August, 2011 Act is being enforced and now we need to take on board the mandate assigned to the Food Authority. The members may give their valued contribution / suggestions for the implementation of the Act.

Item No. I: Oath by New Members

The new members took the oath of office and secrecy in terms of section 7(3) of the Food Safety and Standards Act, 2006 and rule 16 of the Food Safety Standards Authority of India rules, 2008, and also signed the "Annual Declaration of Interest".

Item No. II: Disclosure of Interest by Members

All the members present during the meeting signed the "Specific Declaration of Interest" in respect of the agenda items to be considered in the meeting, before the start of the proceedings.

Item No.III: Confirmation of Minutes of the last meeting held on 6th June, 2012

The Authority confirmed the minutes of the ninth meeting of the Food Authority held on 6th June, 2012.

Item No. IV: Chief Executive Officer's Report

The Authority took note of CEO's report about activities of FSSAI during the year 2011-2012. The CEO, FSSAI briefed the members about the work done by the Food Authority in terms of product approval, online licensing, import, etc. He informed the members about the Codex meetings attended by the Chairperson and CEO of the FSSAI. He also informed the members about the training programmes organized by FSSAI in various states for DOs, and AOs. He informed the Authority about the strengthening of the Codex wing with the joining of Smt. Vinod Kotwal, Scientific and Standards wing with Dr. Meenakshi Singh, Scientist Grade IV (4) and Mr. S. Dave the present Chairman of Codex Alimentarius Commission as Advisor (Standards). His presence will certainly help in standards development particularly switching over to horizontal standard setting and harmonization of standards with international best practices.

Reducted material [Difference in the minutes of CEO &CP]. This issue was discussed briefly. Chairperson, offered to withdraw the content as the issue was brought in by him. Members of the Authority agreed to the withdrawal of the content all together.

Item No. 1: Approval of recommendation of 5th meeting of the Scientific Panels on Functional Foods, Nutraceuticals, Dietetic Products and Other Similar Products for Recommendation of Scientific Panel on regulation for Nutraceuticals, nutritionals, functional foods, Novel Foods and health food Supplements

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on Functional Foods, Nutraceuticals, Dietetic Products and Other Similar Products and Scientific Committee on the draft regulation. The Food Authority discussed the draft regulation. While initiating the discussion one of the member suggested that after the draft regulation was finalized by the Scientific Committee, the draft needs to be sent for stakeholders consultation before being approved by the Food Authority. The Chairperson clarified that the panel chaired by Dr. Prakash had taken inputs from various stakeholders and the consultations were done by the Scientific Panel while preparing the draft regulation.

- (One of the members suggested that the size of the warning should be bigger than the prescribed minimum 3mm font size and should be bold & eye catching. She was of the view that the warning "to be used under medical advice" and should be bilingual (English and Hindi) on the label.

After detailed discussion the Food Authority approved the draft regulation including the Annexures / Tables to the regulation. However, since the regulation is in draft stage consultation may be carried out with Mrs. Indrani Kar before it is sent to Government for publication.

Item No. 2: Approval for addition of Magnesium Carbonate in Pan Masala

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Committee on addition of Magnesium Carbonate in Pan Masala. CEO informed the members that the Agenda is for information and Food Authority need not have any action in this matter.

Item No. 3: Approval for use of Natural Colours as Food Additives

The Food Authority took note of the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved (i) the use of Natural Colours as Food Additives namely Anthocyanins, Copper Chlorophyllin, Natural Carotene, Paprika, Carthmus and Lutein in foods (ii) inclusion of product specifications of these colours under Food Safety and Standards Regulations, 2011 as per JECFA specifications. (iii) these colours should not be allowed in infant foods.

Item No. 4: Approval for use of caramel as natural colour (150d) at G.M.P. level in Carbonated Water, Carbonated Fruit beverages or Fruit Drinks and Synthetic Syrup for use in Dispensers for Carbonated water

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved the (i) use of Caramel Colour (150d) at G.M.P. level in

Carbonated Water and Synthetic Syrups for use in Dispensers for Carbonated Water (ii) Caramel colour (150d) should not be labelled as a Natural Colour and EU guidelines will be followed as per Scientific Committee's recommendation.

Item No. 5: Approval for use of synthetic colour in Thermally Processed Bell Pepper, Okra and Spinach

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee regarding the use of Synthetic Colour in Thermally Processed Bell Pepper, Okra and Spinach. CEO, FSSAI informed the members that the Agenda is for information and Food Authority need not have any action in this matter. With regard to removal of the provision for use of synthetic colour in Thermally Processed Green Beans/ Wax Beans/Green peas and Processed Peas from the Food Safety and Standards Regulations will be taken up separately.

Item No. 6: Approval for use of Aspartame & Acesulfame salt in various food products

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved as under:

(i) Use of blend of Aspartame and Acesulfame Salt (INS 962) in following food products as an artificial sweetener:

Food Category	Maximum permitted level (mg/kg)
1. Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, and whey based drinks)	350
2. Dairy Based desserts e.g pudding. fruit or flavoured yoghurt,	350
3. Jams, jellies, marmalades	1000
4. Chocolate and chocolate products	500

5. Sugar free confectionery	2000
6. Sugar free chewing gum	500
7. Carbonated water	350

(ii) The JECFA purity Standards of this salt (INS 962) may also be adopted.

(iii) The labelling provisions of artificial sweetener shall be applicable.

Item No. 7: Extending the time period for renewal/ conversion of Licenses/ Registrations of FBOs from 5th August, 2012 by 6 months

The Authority members were informed that the date for renewal/ conversion of Licenses/ Registrations of FBOs from 5th August, 2012 has been extended by 6 months and this issue was informed by circulation agenda earlier.

Item No. 8: Approval of use of Steviol Glycoside as an artificial sweetener in various food.

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved the:

- (i) use of Steviol Glycoside as a non-nutritive sweetener in 11 food items based on JECFA ADI of 0-4 mg/ kg bw as per Codex as follows:-

<i>Food Category</i>	<i>Maximum level (mg/kg) (Steviol equivalents)</i>
1. Dairy Based drinks flavoured	200
2. Dairy based desserts (ice cream, frozen desserts, cream toppings)	330
3. Yoghurt	200
4. Fruit nectars	200
5. Non carbonated water based beverages (non-alcoholic)	200
6. Ice Lollies / Edible Ice	270
7. Jams, jellies, marmalades.	360
8. Ready to eat cereals	350

9. Carbonated water	200
10. Soft Drink Concentrate	200*
11. Chewing gum	3500

* in the final product after reconstitution.

- (ii) use of Steviol Glycoside as an Table Top Sweetener in tablet form which may contain 7 mg as Steviol equivalent per 100 mg with carrier/ filler.
- (iii) the specification and purity as prescribed by JECFA shall be adopted.

Item No. 9: Approval of Use of Glucose Oxidase, Xylanase and Lipase Enzyme in Bread.

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved the use of Glucose Oxidase, Xylanase and Lipase Enzyme in Bread and adopted the specifications of these enzymes adopting Codex specification.

Item No. 10: Approval for use of Pullulan as food additives in various foods

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved the use of Pullulan as food additive according to GMP in following products:

- 1) Dairy based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)
- 2) Fat-based dessert excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 1 mentioned above
- 3) Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products
- 4) Seasonings and condiments

Since Pullulan is recognized as a 'novel food', use of it will have to compliant with section 22 requirements of product approval.

Item No. 11: Approval of use of Encapsulation of Ferrous Fumarate (EFF) and additives for Double Fortified Salt (DFS)- Amendment to standards of DFS

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved the use of Encapsulated Ferrous Fumarate (EFF) in iron fortified iodized salt (Double Fortified Salt) and Amendment to the standards [FSSR 2011: Regulation 2.9.30 (5)]. There should be appropriate labelling for the consumers on the salt package. This issue has already been referred to Panel on labelling and claims to develop some labelling requirements on the usage of salt to maintain the level of iodine content. There should be some colour check for awareness of consumers regarding the levels of iodine.

Item No. 12: Approval of the Use of "Gambier" as a Safe Food in Manufacture of Katha

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and Chairperson informed that the Agenda may be deferred until the report of the National Institute of Nutrition, Hyderabad regarding the safety of the Gambier. As a matter of abundant precaution, after consultation with Chairperson, Scientific Committee safety of the product is being ascertained.

Item No. 13: Approval of Use of Carboxymethyl Cellulose as a Stabilizer in beverages

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on food additives, flavourings, processing aids and materials in contact with food & Scientific Committee and approved the (i) use of Carboxymethyl Cellulose as a Stabilizer in ready to serve beverages as GMP. (ii) the level of CMC used and fruit content should be mentioned on the label.

Item No. 14: Approval of draft FSSAI Manuals of Method of Food Testing

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Committee and approved the 15 draft FSSAI manuals of Method of Food Testing and further

approved that these manuals should be reviewed once in three years and should be sent to 2-3 top FSSAI labs for validation and feedback. The Food Authority also appreciated the work done by the Scientific Panel on method of sampling and analysis.

Item No. 15: Approval of confirmation with rationale on Zinc and Copper as nutrient or contaminant.

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Committee and approved Zinc and Copper as micronutrients. The Food Authority further approved that the ICMR prescribed RDA limits for Indian for Zinc and Acceptable intake for Indian for Copper should be followed.

Item No. 16: Deleted from the agenda.

Item No. 17: Approval of Amendment to Food Safety and Standards (Contaminants, Toxins and Residues) Regulations, 2011 with regard to Maximum Residue Limits of Pesticides.

The Food Authority noted the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on pesticides and antibiotic residues & Scientific Committee and approved the amendment to Food Safety and Standards (Contaminants, Toxins and Residues) Regulations, 2011 with regard to Maximum Residue Limits of Pesticides with following changes:-

- (i) Against serial number 183 relating to Chlorantraniliprole that Tolerance Limit for Bitter Gourd should be 0.03 at LOQ instead of 0.3, Okra with tolerance limit of 0.3 needed to be inserted and tolerance limit of Rice should be deleted as it has already been laid down.

One of the members suggested for review of the MRL for Tricyclazole in Rice. The Chairperson suggested that the issue may be taken up separately. The CEO informed that the matter has been referred to Scientific Panel on pesticides and antibiotic residues.

Item No. 18: Approval of agenda note on PIL filed by Advocate Prashant Bhushan on issues of carbonated beverages.

The Food Authority considered the recommendations of the Scientific Panel on Labelling and Claims/Advertisements & Scientific Committee and approved the recommendations and further noted that these recommendations will be given to the Court.

One of the members suggested that for misleading advertisements instead of involving the private agency like Advertisement Standards Council of India (ASCI) who do not have penal power, we should have a committee (Govt. body) consisting of members from Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Ministry of Health and FSSAI. One of the members suggested that the committee should include members from Consumer Organizations.

One of the members also suggested that the 19 cases of misleading advertisements filed for adjudication should be published on the FSSAI website.

Item No. 19.1 & 19.2: Food Safety and Standards Authority of India (Recruitment and Appointment) Regulations, 2012 and Food Safety and Standards Authority of India (Salary and Allowances of Officers and Employees) Regulations, 2012

The Agenda Items were for ratification to the Authority. CEO informed the members that these items have been sent to Ministry of Health and Family Welfare after taking approval of the members by circulation.

Item No. 19.3 & 19.4: Deleted from the agenda.

Item No. 20: Any other item with the approval of Chairperson (Duties of Chairperson, FSSAI)

Reducted material [Difference in the minutes prepared by the CEO & that by CP.] The issue was discussed briefly. Chairperson, offered to withdraw the content as he had initiated the discussion on the subject. The members agreed to the withdrawal of the content all together.

Under any other matter Mr. Bejon Misra emphasised the urgent need for a robust recall mechanism based on tracking and tracing technology mandated on packaged food products manufactured and imported into the country to ensure safety to the consumers. Mr. Misra proposed that to start with, it could be implemented as a pilot initiative in packaged milk and other milk products as it is perceived that such products carry high risk of contamination and adulteration. CEO informed the authority that a regulation for Recall is ready and will go through iterations before it comes to the Authority for approval.

Mrs. S. Girija wanted qualification of fisheries to be included in the Recruitment Rules for different levels of appointment.

In the end, the Chairperson mentioned that as the tenure of the members is getting over a farewell meeting will be scheduled before they demit office.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Chairperson


Chief Executive Officer

[These minutes are conformed minutes. They were confirmed in the XIth Authority Meeting on 30.10.2012].

Tenth Meeting of Food Authority held on 20th September, 2012 at 1100 hrs at FDA Bhavan, New Delhi

List of Participants

Members

1. Sh. K. Chandramouli, Chairperson, FSSAI
2. Sh. S.N. Mohanty, CEO, FSSAI
3. Sh. Utpal Kumar Singh, Joint Secretary, Department of Agriculture and Cooperation, Krishi Bhawan, New Delhi
4. Sh. Manoj Parida, Joint Secretary, M/o Consumer Affairs , Food and Public Distribution Department of Consumer Affairs, Krishi Bhawan, Dr. Rajendra Prasad Road, New Delhi
5. Ms. S. Girija, Director (NIFPHATT), Ministry of Agriculture, Kochi, Kerala
6. Ms. Anuradha Prasad, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Food Processing Industries, Panchsheel Bhawan, New Delhi
7. Sh. Asit K. Tripathi, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Commerce, Department of Commerce & Industry , Udyog Bhawan, New Delhi
8. Ms. Vasundhara Promod Deodhar, C/o Mumbai Grahak Panchayat, Grahak Bhawan, Sant Dnyaneshwar Marg,J.V.P.D., Vile Parle West, Mumbai-400056.
9. Sh. Bejon Mishra, MISRA, Consumer Representative
10. Ms. Indrani Kar, DDC, CII

Officers of FSSAI

1. Sh. S. Dave, Advisor, FSSAI
2. Sh. Dhir Singh, Dir (QA), FSSAI
3. Sh. Pradip Chakraborty, Dir (PA), FSSAI
4. Ms. Vinod Kotwal, Dir (Codex), FSSAI
5. Ms. Meenakshi, Scientist (Standard), FSSAI
6. Sh. Anil Mehta, DD (Standard), FSSAI
7. Sh. R.K. Saxena, DD (GA), FSSAI
8. Sh. P. Karthikeyan, AD (QA), FSSAI
9. Ms. Pushpinder Kaur, Technical Officer, FSSAI

